



Initial Consultation Report from Tara A. Fantauzzi Patregnani Professional Genealogist



Summary of Research Recommendations:

The purpose of this report is to summarize the data and goals for your project. Please review the information in this report carefully and report if any additional information is known at project start or if any of the information should be changed or corrected.

After your most recent phase of work we identified that the best subjects to continue to research (most likely to produce positive findings) include (1) the identity and direct ancestors of Thomas P. Williams, (2) the identity and direct ancestors of William Robinson, (3) the identity and direct ancestors of Nettie Mae Tillotson, (4) the direct ancestors of Henry Barker and (5) the identity of Mary McGuinness. Please see the list provided at the end of this report for a breakdown of research tasks that has been recommended for these subjects.

I may be able to recommend additional work to investigate the identity of Mary McGuinness but to learn more about her identity it is important to first submit a request to the New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene to obtain a copy of her death record for analysis. Currently the identities of her parents are not yet known and have been difficult to establish and this record may reveal information about her parents. Due to privacy law the record request must be completed by your husband, or if you prefer I can help fill out the form to be signed and submitted by him.

(<https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/doh/downloads/pdf/vr/death-certificate-application.pdf>)

I had the opportunity to connect with Dan to discuss his research experience regarding the identities and direct ancestors of Edward McLaughlin, Elizabeth McNulty, James White and Catherine Joy. I closely reviewed the information he has compiled on his ancestry account and the notes that you have passed on to me since we began research, as well as all of the research we have completed to date to prepare the recommendations below.

(5) Identity, Siblings & Direct Ancestors of Edward McLaughlin

Up to this point it has proven difficult to conclusively determine the origins of our subject Edward McLaughlin who resided in Chicago and married Elizabeth McNulty. His State and



Roman Catholic marriage records did not report his specific place of Irish origin or the identities of his parents (see relevant notes¹²), and his 1938 death record submitted did not report the identities of his parents. His death record stated that he was born on the 4th of October 1872.

Dan and I discussed that I received a letter from the Clerk of the Circuit Court of Cook County that no naturalization record was found for our subject Edward McLaughlin after I submitted a detailed request to their office. I have completed searches but have not been able to find a specific migration record to conclusively link to the identity of our subject. I have not yet found any evidence on the likely siblings of Edward McLaughlin reported as being James McLaughlin, born circa 1860, Daniel McLaughlin, born circa 1864, and John McLaughlin, born circa 1866. It was hypothesized on the Ancestry member account of Dan that he was born in Carrownagaonagh, County Donegal Ireland.

I recommend applying up to two hours of research time completing a digital collections survey on the identity, siblings and parents of Edward McLaughling to help determine if there is a connection to Carrownagaonagh, County Donegal Ireland as well as to verify the accuracy of the siblings and parents identities to Edward McLaughlin.

(6) Identity of Elizabeth McNulty

The least is known regarding the identity of Elizabeth McNulty. In preparation of this report I searched her name using the Chicago city database of deaths recorded there from 1871-1998 and found an index entry that reported she was born on the 26th of March 1878 at an unspecified location in Ireland to parents whose names were not reported. Her specific date and place of death were said to have been the 18th of January 1959 in River Forest, Cook County, Illinois. The death informant was Helen Berdelle.

We previously discussed that we may want to order a copy of her death record but the discovery of the death index entry makes it less relevant because the death index entry reported the most important facts to glean from the record. Her date and place of birth was described but unfortunately no parents were listed on the record. State and Roman Catholic marriage records did not report specific information about the origins of Elizabeth like specific place of birth or the identities of her parents.

I recommend applying up to two hours of research time completing a digital collections survey on the identity of Elizabeth McNulty to at least find a migration record or evidence that may lead to confirming a more specific place of origin or the identities of immediate or extended family in the U.S.

¹ [MCLAUGHLIN - 1895 Marriage Record for Edward McLaughlin & Lizzie McNulty](#)

² [MCLAUGHLIN - 1895 Roman Catholic Marriage Registration for Edward McLaughlin & Lizzie McNulty](#)



(7) Identity and Direct Ancestors of James White

I reviewed what I have found up to this date on James White and it is important to note that on U.S. records he was consistently referred to as 'James White' without reference to a middle initial. A 1900 Federal population census³ reported James White was born in May 1866 in England to parents also born in England. His 1905 death record⁴ did not report identifying information like his specific place of origin although reference was made that he was born in England, and no description regarding the identities of his parents was on the record because it was not a question on the death record. 1892 State⁵ and Roman Catholic⁶ marriage records found for James White and his bride Katie did not contain identifying information to report his specific place of origin or the identities of his parents.

I found an 1866 Roman Catholic baptismal record for James 'Jacobus' White⁷ born on the 3rd of July 1866 to parents Pat White and Cath. Kain, baptized at St. Anthony's, Liverpool, Lancashire, England and I obtained a copy of an original 1866 English birth registration for James White⁸ from the English General Registration Office, born in Saint Martin, Liverpool, Lancashire, England to parents Patrick White, stoker at a sugar house, and mother Catherine Cain at a home with residence at 41 Hopewood Street.

We are currently lacking evidence from the U.S. to verify a correct match with the English baptism and birth registration for child James White son of Patrick White and Catherine Cain so I investigated the likely parents of James known as Patrick White and Catherine Cain to determine if the information submitted on the Ancestry member account of Dan was accurate and also if any evidence presented a conflict to indicate that it may be possible our subject in Chicago was not the same child on the 1866 baptism and English birth record found. I found an 1853 Roman Catholic marriage record for Patrick White and Catherine 'Kean'⁹ that reported they were married at St Mary Highfield Street in Liverpool, Lancashire, England. I also found an 1861 England census for the household of Patrick White¹⁰, fireman at a sugar house, that reported he lived in Liverpool that year with his wife, mother in law, and son John.

On Dan's ancestry account it describes that Patrick White died in 1866 and it seems likely that this date of death comes from an English death index entry because I found a reference for a thirty-two year old Patrick White, but the index¹¹ does not contain identifying information on the deceased. To determine if the 1866 death index entry was accurate I completed an investigation

³ [WHITE - 1900 Federal population census, Lake, Chicago, Cook, Illinois, Family No. 234](#)

⁴ [WHITE - 1905 Death Record for James White](#)

⁵ [WHITE - 1892 Marriage Record for James White & Katie Joyce](#)

⁶ [WHITE - 1892 Roman Catholic Marriage Registration for James White & Katie Joyce](#)

⁷ [WHITE - 1866 Roman Catholic Baptism Record for James White](#)

⁸ [WHITE - 1866 Birth Registration for James Patrick White](#)

⁹ [WHITE - 1853 Roman Catholic Marriage Registration for Patrick White & Catherine Kean](#)

¹⁰ [WHITE - 1861 England census, Liverpool, Lancashire, England, Household No. 821](#)

¹¹ [WHITE - 1866 Death Record Index Entry for Patrick White](#)



to find an 1871 England census on the household of what I believed would have been a widowed Catherine with at least one son, our subject James White, who would have been about five to six years old. I found an 1871 England census for the household of Patrick White¹² living at 41 Hopewell Street that reported Patrick was living along with his wife Catherine, children John, Mary, Patrick and Anna as well as mother in law Jane Kane.

The 1871 England census presents a conflict because if the father of James White was deceased in 1866 he would not have made the 1871 England census. The 1871 England census also raises more questions regarding the family of our subject James White because on the 1900 census for James White he reported that he entered the U.S. circa 1870 when he was about four years old, which is also evidence that he likely would not make an 1871 England census. I have not yet found a migration record to prove the date and place of entry for our subject James and it will be important to continue to seek it out because he likely traveled with at least one immediate family member since he was a minor when he migrated to the U.S.

As stated earlier the residence of the White family in 1871 cross checks against the 1866 birth record for James White from Liverpool because the residence of the White family in 1871 was the same place where the child named James White was born in 1866. It is of interest to note that on the 1871 England census there is no child named James White born in 1866 living at the household which likely means the 1866 death index entry referenced by Dan for a possible father of our subject may be a reference to the child named James White from the 1866 English birth record who died shortly after his birth or that the age on the death index entry was mistranscribed.

The 1866 death index entry for James White stated the death occurred in July-August-September which means it is possible if a transcription error occurred on the death index entry it could be for an infant aged three months or less because James White from the 1866 birth record was born in July 1866. The one problem with this theory is that the 1866 death record reported the deceased Patrick White was thirty two when he died, which unless that is a typo with the index entry, may rule out the idea that it was for an infant. Even if the 1866 death index entry is for an adult it cannot be related to the 1871 head of household Patrick White because in 1871 he was alive and described on the record as being forty one years old, which means he was born circa 1830. Until a copy of the 1866 death record is obtained from the English General Registration Office it is too early to conclude who the record is related to, but the bigger issue right now is that it doesn't seem likely that our subject James was related to the family mentioned above.

One way to try and determine if the two White families were related to one another would be to further investigate the White family on the 1871 England census to find more conflicting information or possibly to find evidence that may prove that family did eventually have ties to Chicago. Another document that I believe is key to finding on our subject James White is a copy of his migration record because he migrated at such a young age he likely arrived with at least one adult. The identity of anyone he traveled with could be investigated further to determine if our subject was related to the White family from Liverpool or if it may be possible he had

¹² [WHITE - 1871 England census - Conflicting Evidence](#)



origins from another place in England. I am hesitant to recommend a search be done to find naturalization paperwork for our subject because it seems possible that he may have become a naturalized citizen as a minor if his father naturalized or if his mother came to the U.S. a widow and married someone who was naturalized therefore no paperwork would exist under his name. In addition, naturalization paperwork from pre-1906 is typically vague and it may not be possible to find information like date and place of entry but most importantly specific place of origin.

I recommend applying up to two hours of research time completing a digital collections survey on the White family from Liverpool and the identity of James White with an emphasis to find proof of migration to the U.S. At the end of this survey I may be able to more confidently rule out the connection to the White family of Liverpool or possibly find some evidence to prove there is a connection. I think it is very important to find proof of migration for James White as a child because his age at the time he traveled may help to pinpoint the right record to find for analysis.

(8) Identity and Direct Ancestors of Catherine 'Katie' Joy[Joyce]

Throughout the evidence that we have found there are instances in which there are name variations for the identity of Catherine 'Katie' Joy[Joyce]. The surname appeared on two documents I found including (1) an 1892 City marriage license and certificate for James White and Katie 'JOYCE' as well as (2) an 1892 Roman Catholic marriage registration for James White and Katie 'JOYCE'. The surname was spelled 'JOY' on (3) a record obtained from the Irish General Registration Office a copy of an original 1875 Irish birth registration for a child named Catherine 'Joy' born in Waterford, County Waterford, Ireland on the 5th of September 1872, and (4) surname 'Joy' on 1924 Chicago death index entry for Ellen 'Joy' most likely mother of Catherine.

The surname 'Joyce' appeared on an 1892 city marriage license and certificate for James White and Katie Joyce¹³. The city marriage license reported they got their license to be married in Chicago, Cook County, Illinois on the 26th of January 1892 and later were married at a Roman Catholic church in the city of Chicago by a priest referred to as Dennis Hayes. He certified that James White and Miss Katie Joyce were married by him on the 28th of January 1892. No identifying information was reported on the license and certificate regarding facts like place of origin as well as identities of the parents to the bride and groom.

The surname 'Joyce' also appeared on an 1892 Roman Catholic marriage registration for James White and Katie 'Joyce'¹⁴. It reported the couple was married by the priest Dennis Hayes on the 28th of January 1892. Witnesses to the marriage were R.H. Brown and Statia Powers. No identifying information was reported on the license and certificate regarding facts like place of origin as well as identities of the parents to the bride and groom.

¹³ [WHITE - 1892 Marriage Record for James White & Katie Joyce](#)

¹⁴ [WHITE - 1892 Roman Catholic Marriage Registration for James White & Katie Joyce](#)



The surname 'JOY' was recorded on a copy of an original 1872 birth registration obtained from the Irish General Registration Office for Catherine 'Joy'¹⁵ born on the 5th of September 1872 in Waterford, County Waterford, Ireland. Her parents were described as seaman Michael Joy and wife Ellen Walsh.

On the Ancestry member account of Dan a 1924 death index entry was submitted for a woman named Ellen 'Joy' who died in the City of Chicago on the 8th of March 1924. The death index reported she had the maiden name Walsh because her parents were noted as being Ed Walsh and Nellie White. A reference was made to a husband named Michael Joy, but at the time of her death he was deceased because she was described on the record as being a widow when she died. This index entry can be found on the Ancestry Member account of Dan.

Together the four pieces of documentation found that were discussed above help to prove that our subject Catherine resided in Chicago was most likely the child Catherine Joy born in the City of Waterford to parents Michael Joy and Ellen Walsh in 1872. Although there is very little evidence from her later life in the U.S. to cross check against the 1872 Irish birth record a unique find submitted by Dan was the 1924 death index entry for Ellen Joy because it specifically reported her husband was Michael Joy and it also proves she was a resident of Chicago where her daughter was known to live. Up to this date I have been unable to find proof from the U.S. to indicate that there were any siblings of Catherine and I also have been unable to find proof that Michael Joy migrated to the U.S., which means he may have died in Ireland before his wife and daughter left.

I recommend applying up to two hours of research time completing a digital collections survey on the direct ancestors of Catherine Joy beginning with her parents known as Michael Joy and Ellen Walsh to find at least State and/or Roman Catholic index entries or records for the marriage of Michael Joy and Ellen Walsh, the baptism of Ellen Walsh, and the death of Michael Joy. It may be worth investigating the identities of the witnesses to the 1892 marriage of Catherine to James White because either party may have had familial ties to the bride and/or groom. I also want to determine if the Roman Catholic baptismal records from Kilkenny County, Ireland for Edmond Walsh¹⁶ and Ellen Walsh¹⁷ were found for the right individuals.



Digital Collections Survey is a term we use to describe a research survey that exhausts all available collections of documents that are published online including but not limited to Ancestry.com and other premium information service databases. Copies of original documentation may include census, vital, military, probate, land and church records; secondary documentation may include copies of record transcriptions, record index entries and published genealogies.

¹⁵ [JOYCE - Birth registration for Catherine 'Joy'](#)

¹⁶ [WALSH - 1838 Roman Catholic Baptismal Record for Edmond Walsh](#)

¹⁷ [WALSH Roman Catholic Baptismal Record for Ellen Walsh](#)



Itemized List of Research Recommendations:

(1) Digital Collections Survey, Up to 2 hours research time

- Research survey on the identity and direct ancestors of Thomas P. Williams that will search all available collections of documents that are published online including but not limited to Ancestry.com premium databases. Copies of original documentation may include census, vital, military, probate, land and church records; secondary documentation may include copies of record transcriptions, record index entries and published genealogies.

(2) Digital Collections Survey, Up to 2 hours research time

- Research survey on the identity and direct ancestors of William Robinson that will search all available collections of documents that are published online including but not limited to Ancestry.com premium databases. Copies of original documentation may include census, vital, military, probate, land and church records; secondary documentation may include copies of record transcriptions, record index entries and published genealogies.

(3) Digital Collections Survey, Up to 2 hours research time

- Research survey on the identity and direct ancestors of Nettie Mae Tillotson that will search all available collections of documents that are published online including but not limited to Ancestry.com premium databases. Copies of original documentation may include census, vital, military, probate, land and church records; secondary documentation may include copies of record transcriptions, record index entries and published genealogies.

(4) Digital Collections Survey, Up to 2 hours research time

- Research survey on the identity and direct ancestors of Henry Barker that will search all available collections of documents that are published online including but not limited to Ancestry.com premium databases. Copies of original documentation may include census, vital, military, probate, land and church records; secondary documentation may include copies of record transcriptions, record index entries and published genealogies.

(5) Digital Collections Survey, Up to 2 hours research time

- Research survey on the identity, siblings and parents of Edward McLaughlin to help determine if there is a connection to Carrownagaonagh, County Donegal Ireland as well as to verify the accuracy of the siblings and parents identities to Edward McLaughlin. Genealogist will search all available collections of documents that are published online including but not limited to Ancestry.com premium databases. Copies of original documentation may include census, vital, military, probate, land and church records; secondary documentation may include copies of record transcriptions, record index entries and published genealogies.

**(6) Digital Collections Survey, Up to 2 hours research time**

- Research survey on the identity of Elizabeth McNulty to at least find a migration record or evidence that may lead to confirming a more specific place of origin, identities of immediate or extended family in the U.S.. Genealogist will search all available collections of documents that are published online including but not limited to Ancestry.com premium databases. Copies of original documentation may include census, vital, military, probate, land and church records; secondary documentation may include copies of record transcriptions, record index entries and published genealogies.

(7) Digital Collections Survey, Up to 2 hours research time

- Research survey on the White family from Liverpool and the identity of James White with an emphasis to find proof of migration to the U.S. At the end of this survey I may be able to more confidently rule out the connection to the White family of Liverpool or possibly find some evidence to prove there is a connection. I think it is very important to find proof of migration for James White as a child because his age at the time he traveled may help to pinpoint the right record to find for analysis. Genealogist will search all available collections of documents that are published online including but not limited to Ancestry.com premium databases. Copies of original documentation may include census, vital, military, probate, land and church records; secondary documentation may include copies of record transcriptions, record index entries and published genealogies.

(8) Digital Collections Survey, Up to 2 hours research time

- Research survey on the direct ancestors of Catherine Joy beginning with her parents known as Michael Joy and Ellen Walsh to find at least State and/or Roman Catholic index entries or records for the marriage of Michael Joy and Ellen Walsh, the baptism of Ellen Walsh, and the death of Michael Joy. It may be worth investigating the identities of the witnesses to the 1892 marriage of Catherine to James White because either party may have had familial ties to the bride and/or groom. I also want to determine if the Roman Catholic baptismal records from Kilkenny County, Ireland for Edmond Walsh and Ellen Walsh were found for the right individuals.
-